BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084446 3

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

With the assistance of Jonathan Yen, Paul Veugelers, and Hilda Wong

FALL 1990

The materials reproduced in this casebook are for the use of the students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and are not for commercial sale.

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 6 1990

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

With the assistance of Jonathan Yen, Paul Veugelers, and Hilda Wong

FALL 1990

The materials reproduced in this casebook are for the use of the students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and are not for commercial sale.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casebookoncanadi00zieg_2

PREFACE TO 1988 EDITION

The materials in this volume, collated under considerable pressure, are designed for an introductory one-semester, two-hours-a-week seminar on Canadian bankruptcy and receivership law.

I owe two particular debts. One is to Jonathan Yen (U. of T., LL.B. 1987) for shouldering much of the burden of compiling the materials; the other is to the editors of Gertner, Springman, McGuinness, Morrison, Stewart and Laskin, Debtor and Creditor, 3rd ed. (1987), and especially to Jody Morrison and George Stewart for facilitating my task of selecting suitable bankruptcy cases.

J.S.Z.

10.8.88

PREFACE TO 1989 EDITION

The 1988 edition has been updated to take account of important case law and other developments and to include some problem situations for discussion in the Seminar.

I am grateful to Paul Veugelers, U. of T., LL.B.I., and Richard Kramer, an Osgoode Hall Law School student, for their respective assistance with these changes.

J.S.Z.

10.8.89

PREFACE TO 1990 EDITION

Once again significant changes have been made to the previous edition and I am grateful to Hilda Wong, LL.B. II, for assisting me with them.

J.S.Z.

15.8.90

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW, FALL 1990

SYLLABUS AND TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page No.

Preface i

Selected Bibliography xiii

Week I, Sept. 11 THE OBJECTIVES OF BANKRUPTCY LAW, CANADIAN HISTORY AND CURRENT PROCEDURES FOR MAKING A PERSON BANKRUPT

A. Objectives & History of Bankruptcy Law

Extracts, Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law..... 1

Extracts, Tassé Report, "The History of Bankruptcy"..... 12

Id., "The Present Canadian Legislation"..... 18

Id., "The Canadian Legislation Since Confederation"..... 23

"Bankruptcy Statistics"..... 29

B. Commencement of Bankruptcy Proceedings:

1. Involuntary Bankruptcy:

R.S.C. 1985: 42-46, 2 (definition of "locality of debtor"), 12(1), 187(9) to (11)

Re Holmes and Sinclair 33

Re Cedarhurst Properties Ltd. 36

Re Gaudet 40

2. Voluntary Bankruptcy

R.S.C. 1985: ss.49, 42(2), 181, 155, 2. (Definition of

"insolvent person", "locality of a debtor", "person" and "corporation").

In re Johns Manville Corp. 46

3. Consequences of Receiving Order/Assignment

R.S.C. 1975, ss.69(1), stay of proceedings, 70(1) precedence over judgment, execution, etc., 71(2) vesting of property; 73, effect on executions and seizure for rents or taxes.

Week 2 Sept. 18. COLLECTION OF BANKRUPTCY ESTATE & PROPERTY EXCLUDED THEREFROM

R.S.C. 1985: 67-68, 70-75.

1. "Property" vesting in trustee -- exceptions thereto

Re Ritenburg; Ritenburg v. Crown Trust Company 49

Deloitte, Haskins & Sells Limited v. Graham 53

2. Executory Contracts and Leases 57

Re Limestone Electric & Supply Co. 58

U.S. Bankruptcy Code, s.365 62

In re Booth 68

3. Exempt Property

Re Neuls and Neuls; Touche Ross Limited v. First City Trust Company 73

Extract, Tassé Report, "Exemptions" 82

Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, s.158 83

4. Property subject to a trust:

R.S.C. 1985: s.67.

James F. Lawrie & Company Limited v. Moffat 84

Royal Bank of Canada v. 216200 Alberta Ltd. 88
(see also infra Week 4)

Week 3 Sept. 25: TREATMENT OF SECURED CREDITORS

1. Ziegel & Garton: Statistical Profile of Creditors in Bankruptcy 92

2. Property subject to a security interest

R.S.C. 1985: ss.71(2), 2 (definition of "secured creditor")

Re Bright 97

Re Szeles 104

Extract, Ziegel, Geva & Cuming, Commercial & Consumer Transactions, 2nd ed. 108

Extracts from the Ontario Personal Property Security Act, 1989, ss.1-2; 9-15 115

Extract, Varley, "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors" 122

Goode, "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?".. 126

Ziegel, "Too Much, Too Little or Just Right?"..... 139

3. Treatment of Secured Creditors under the Act

R.S.C. 1985: ss.127, 128, 132, 133.

Extract, Houlden & Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada 155

Re Ryan 157

Week 4 Oct. 2: STATUTORY TRUSTS AND PREFERENTIAL GOVERNMENT LIEN CLAIMS

R.S.C. 1985: ss.136(1), 67.

Deputy Minister of Revenue v. Paul Rainville 160

Deloitte Haskins and Sells Limited v. W.C.B. 164

British Columbia v. Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd. 171

Bank of Montreal v. Scott Road Enterprises 176

Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, ss.265(1), 265(4)(i), 270 184

Extract, Advisory Committee Report, "Crown Priority" 185

Bogart, "Statutory Claims and PPS Legislation: A Proposal" 189

Plumb, "The New Federal Tax Lien Law" 201

Week 5 Oct. 9: DISTRIBUTION OF BANKRUPT'S ESTATE: PREFERRED CLAIMS (See also, supra, Week 4)

R.S.C. 1985: 136(1)

(a) Landlord's Claim

In re Gingras 205

(b) Wage Earners' Priorities

Extracts, Advisory Committee Report, "Wage Earners Protection" 209

Brown, "Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations". 223

Gleig, "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" 231

See also materials, supra, Week 4

(c) Directors' Liabilities for Unpaid Wages and other Benefits

OBCA s.131 242

CBCA s.114 243

(d) Recommendations for Reform

Extract, Tassé Report 244

(e) Trustee's Preferred Status and Taxation Principles:

Re Hoskinson 248

Week 6 Oct. 16: AVOIDANCE AND REVIEW OF ANTECEDENT TRANSACTIONS

R.S.C. 1985: SS.38, 68(1)

(a) Avoidance of Security Interests

OPPSA 1989: s.20

Re Bellini Manufacturing and Importing Ltd. 255

International Harvester v. Touche Ross 258

Notes 266

(b) Settlements

R.S.C. 1985: ss.91, 92, 93

Re Whetstone 268

Re Camgoz 276

(c) Reviewable Transactions

R.S.C. 1985: ss.100 & 101

Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report 282

Clarkson v. White 291

Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, ss.169-175 294

(d) Preferences

R.S.C. 1985: s.95

Hudson v. Benallack 296

Re Van Der Liek 300

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c.176 302

Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report 304

(e) Protected Transactions

R.S.C. 1985: s.97

(f) Interaction of Federal and Provincial Legislation and Constitutional Issues

Robinson v. Countrywide Factors Ltd. 310

Pacaar Financial Services v. Sinco Trucking 318

Week 7 Oct. 23 CONSEQUENCES OF BANKRUPTCY AND DISCHARGE FROM BANKRUPTCY

(a) Consequences of Bankruptcy

Vachon v. Canada Employment and Immigration Commission 327

Amanda Designs Boutique Limited v. Charisma Fashion 335

(b) Discharge from Bankruptcy

R.S.C. 1985: ss.169-182

Kozack v. Richter 342

Consumers' Gas Co. v. Stewart 346

Re McAfee 349

Ferron, "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" 360

Extract, Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law... 371

Week 8 Oct. 30: ALTERNATIVES TO BANKRUPTCY: COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATIONS

Problem 386

R.S.C. 1985: Part III

Fisher Oil & Gas v. Guaranty Bank & Trust Company 388

Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd. v. A.G. Can. 392

Extract, Houlden & Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada 395

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1970, c.C-25. 397

Crozier, "Good Faith and the CCAA" 401

Re Meredian Developments Inc. 408

Re The Wellington Building Corp'n Ltd. 416

In re Bilton Bros. Ltd. 423

Simon Scott et al., "The Arrangement Procedure under CBCA s.192"..... 425

Leonard, "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations"..... 449

Week 9 Nov. 6: COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATIONS AND CHAPTER 11 OF THE U.S. BANKRUPTCY CODE

There will be a separate handout of materials.

Week 10 Nov. 13: CONSUMER ARRANGEMENTS AND CONSUMER BANKRUPTCIES

R.S.C. 1985: Part X

Orderly Payment of Debts Statistics 464

Ziegel, "Consumer Bankruptcies" 465

Extract, Brighton & Connidis, "Consumer Bankrupts in Canada" 470

Bill C-17, 1984, Part III 485

Problem 493

Week 11 Nov. 20 RECEIVERSHIPS AND FIXED AND FLOATING CHARGES

A. FLOATING CHARGES

I. The Floating Charge at Common Law and under the PPSA

1. Common Law Position

Pennington, "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" 495

R. in Right of B.C. v. F.B.D.B..... 499

2. Crystallization of Floating Charge

The Queen in Right of British Columbia v. Consolidated Churchill Copper Corp. Ltd. 510

Mackay and Hughes (1973) Ltd. v. Martin Potatoes Inc. 522

3. Demand for Payment: How Much Time is the Debtor Entitled To?

Kavcar Investments v. Aetna Financial Services 527

II. The Floating Charge under the Ontario PPSA

OPPSA ss.9, 11, 19, 20, 25, 33, 55

Re Huxley Catering Limited v. CIBC 539

Royal Bank of Canada v. G.M. Homes Inc. 542

Notes 543

Ziegel, "Recent and Prospective Developments in the PPSA Area" 544

Week 12 Nov. 27: B. STATUS, DUTIES AND POWERS OF RECEIVERS

1. Definition and History

Extract, Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers 548

2. Court Appointed and Privately Appointed Receivers: Practical and Legal Considerations

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships..... 551

Royal Bank of Canada v. White Cross Properties Ltd. 553

Federal Trust Company v. Frisina 556

3. Differences Between Receiver and Manager

In re Manchester and Milford Railway Co. 560

4. Duties and Powers of Receivers

CBCA ss.94-95 (Part VIII)..... 565

Parsons v. The Sovereign Bank of Canada 566

Re TIW Industries Ltd. and Clarkson Co. Ltd..... 569

5. Status of Receivers as Agent of Company

Peat Marwick Ltd. v. Consumers' Gas Co. 572

Sperry Inc. v. C.I.B.C. 579

6. Termination of Receivership

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 584

Week 13 Dec. 4: RECEIVERSHIPS (Cont'd)

7. Rules with Respect to Realization

J.& W. Investments Ltd. v. Black 593

Cuckmere Brick Co. Ltd. v. Mutual Finance Ltd..... 598

OPPSA 1989, s.63..... 606

8. Bankruptcy and Receiverships

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 609

Gosling v. Gaskell 611

Extract, Advisory Committee, "Receiverships and Secured Creditors"..... 615

9. Conflict of Laws Aspects

C.A. Kennedy Co. Ltd. v. Stibbe-Monte Ltd..... 629

Clarkson Co. Ltd. v. Rockwell 638

10. Problem..... 642

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: CANADA

T.G. Anderson, Proprietary and Quasi-proprietary Rights Arising upon Insolvency, University of Toronto (1981).

Bankruptcy: Present Problems and Future Perspectives, Faculty of Law, McGill University (1986).

D.G. Baird & T.H. Jackson, Cases, Problems and Materials on Bankruptcy, (1985).

F. Bennett, Receiverships, Carswell (1985).

F. Bennett, Bankruptcy Legislation, CCH Can., 1989.

J.W. Brighton, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada (1982).

Business Law: Commercial Insolvency, CBAO (1983).

Duncan and Honsberger, Bankruptcy in Canada, 3rd ed., Canadian Legal Authors Ltd. (1961).

Gertner, Springman et al. Debtor and Creditor: Cases and Commentary, 3rd ed. Carswell (1987).

Houlden and Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada, 3rd ed., Carswell (1989).

Impact of Insolvency on Business Relationships, CBAO (1987).

Is Bankruptcy Merely "Back to Business"?, CBAO (1983).

Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?", CBAO (1983).

Priorities: Who Gets What After the Fall, CBAO (1984).

Staying Alive: Proposals and Reorganizations, OBCA (1984).

B. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: ENGLAND AND AUSTRALIA

M. Crystal, A Handbook on Bankruptcy and Deeds of Arrangement Law and Practice, London: (1978).

P.G. Earles, A Guide to Bankruptcy, Professional Books (1984).

R.M. Goode, Proprietary Rights and Insolvency in Sales Transactions, Sweet & Maxwell (1985).

W.W. Kerr, Kerr on the Law and Practice as to the Receivers, 16th ed., Sweet & Maxwell (1983).

G. Lightman, The Law of Receivers of Companies, Sweet & Maxwell, (1986).

D. Milman, Corporate Insolvency: Law and Practice, Sweet & Maxwell, (1987).

J. O'Donovan, Company Receivers and Managers, The Law Book Company Limited (1981).

H.A.P. Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers, Butterworths (1984).

P.W.D. Redmon, Bankruptcy Law, 7th ed., Macdonald & Evans (1977).

P. Totty, Corporate Insolvency, McGraw-Hill (1982).

C. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform, American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Reform (1978).

J.R. Blinn, Bankruptcy Strategies for Lenders, Professional Education Systems (1987).

P. Blumberg, The Law of Corporate Groups: Problems in the Bankruptcy Reorganization of Parent and Subsidiary Corporations, Little Brown (1985).

W.M. Collier, Collier Bankruptcy Manual, Matthew Bender (1979).

D.R. Cowans, Bankruptcy Law and Practice, West Publishing (1986).

T.H. Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy law, Harvard University Press (1986).

L. Kruger & Quittner, Bankruptcy Practice and Procedure, Practising Law Institute (1985).

M.S. Lurey, Lending Transactions and the Bankruptcy Code,1987, Practicing Law Institute (1987).

A.L. Paskay, Handbook for Trustees and Receivers in Bankruptcy, Bender (1978).

Quittner & L. Krugger, Current Developments in Bankruptcy and Reorganization, 1986, Practicing Law Institute (1986).

D. ARTICLES

W.A. Bogart "Statutory Claims and Personal Property Security Legislation: A Proposal" (1983) C.B.L.J. 129.

L.J. Crozier "Good Faith and the Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act" (1989), 15 Can. Bus. L.J. 89.

J.M. Ferron "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" (1985) 61 C.B.R. (N.S.) 134.

A. Giroux "The Use of the Bankruptcy Act by Secured Creditors" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 232.

R.A. Gitlin "The International Void in the Law of Multinational Bankruptcies" (1987) 42 Bus. Law 307.

D.B. Gleig "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" (1987) 21 U.B.C.L.R. 61.

R.M. Goode "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?" (1983-84) 8 C.B.L.J. 53.

A.K. Kemp-Gee "Insolvency in Practice: A Receiver's View" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 615.

E.B. Leonard "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 161.

W. Meckling "Financial Markets, Default and Bankruptcy: The Role of the State" (1977) 41 Law & Contemporary Problems 13.

R.G. Marantz "Current Trends in Canadian Bankruptcy Law" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 659.

M. Mendelsohn "Canada: A Secured Creditor's Paradise?" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 105.

D. Milman "Receivers as Agents" (1981) 44 M.L.R. 658.

J. O'Donovan "The Duties and Liabilities of a Receiver and Manager Appointed Out of Court" (1979) 12 M.U.L.R. 52.

R. Pennington "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" (1960) 23 M.L.R. 630.

A. Petomaa "Constitutional Validity of Provincial Legislation Subordinating Unperfected Security Interests to Trustees in Bankruptcy" 42 C.B.R. (N.S.) 104.

W. T. Plumb "The New Federal Tax Lien Law" (1966-67) 22 Business Lawyers 271.

J.J. Quinn "Corporate Reorganization and Strategic Behaviour: An Economic Analysis of Canadian Insolvency Law and Recent Proposals for Reform" (1985) 23 O.H.L.J. 1.

R.N. Robertson "Legal Problems on Reorganization of Major Financial and Commercial Debtors" in Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?", CBAO (1983).

M. Scott "The Provinces and the Bankruptcy Act: An End Run" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 73.

M.G. Shanker "The Worthier Creditors (and a Cheer for the King)" (1975-76) 1 C.B.L.J. 340.

M.A. Springman "The B.C.L.R.C. Report on Fraudulent Conveyances and Preferences" (1989), 15 CBLJ 180.

H.W. Sterling, "Seizures Under Demand Debentures" (1985) 53 C.B.R. (N.S.) 129.

J.R. Varley "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors" in Debtor-Creditor Law: Practice and Doctrine (Springman and Gertner, eds. 1985).

J.R. Varley "Recent Developments and Emerging Trends in the Enforcement of Security - The Receiver Besieged" in Special Lectures of the LSUC 1985, 181.

J.S. Ziegel "Consumer Bankruptcies" (1972) 20 Chitty's L.J. 325.

J.S. Ziegel "Recent and Prospective Developments in the Personal Property Security Area and the Recommendations of the Ontario Advisory Committee" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 1.

J.S. Ziegel "The Supreme Court of Canada Scuttles the Deemed Trust in Bankruptcy" (1989), 15 CBLJ ___.

E. REPORTS

Brighton & Connidis, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Policy Research, Analysis and Liason Directorate, Policy Coordination Bureau, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada.

D.J.M. Brown Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations, (1985).

L.R.C.B.C.; Fraudulent Conveyances and Preferences, Woring Paper No.53 (1986).

Report of the Advisory Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency: Proposed Bankruptcy Act Amendments (**Advisory Committee Report**), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1986).

Report of the Study Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency Legislation Canada 1970 (**Tassé Report**), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1970).

Report of the Review Committee on Insolvency Law and Practice, Cmnd. 8558, (1982).

F. STATUTES: CANADA

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. B-3.

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. C-36.

Farm Debt Review Act, S.C. 1986, c. C-33.

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 176.

Winding Up Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. W-11.

An Act Respecting Bankruptcy and Insolvency, Bill-17, 1984.

G. STATUTES: ENGLAND

Insolvency Act, 1986.

H. STATUTES: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform Act of 1978, Pub. L. No. 95-598, 92 stat. 2549 (1978) (codified at 11 U.S.C. ss. 101 et seq.)

The Bankruptcy Amendments and Federal Judgeship Act of 1984, Pub. 1. No. 98-353, 98 Stat. 333 (1984) (enacted July 10, 1984)